



STATE OF OKLAHOMA  
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

November 4, 2015  
Date

280  
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on November 4, 2015 at 9:30 a.m. The Meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, November 2, 2015 at 9:00 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on October 28, 2015 and posted to the REAB website on November 2, 2015. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Vice-Chairperson Lee R. Caesar Jr. called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:           John D. Doak;  
  Lee R. Caesar Jr.;  
  James R. Artman;  
  Betty J. Cagle;  
  H.E. Ted Smith;  
  Stephen C. Walton

Board members excused were:       Shelley Pruitt and John Smithson

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Barron Brown, OID Counsel; and Eric Schoen, Board Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb and Brett Robinson.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Walton moved that the reading of the minutes of the October 7, 2015 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Artman. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF BEN B. BOOTHE AND RICHARD J. TIBBENHAM; COMPLAINT #14-024; TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "C")

After a brief presentation by Steve McCaleb, Ms. Cagle moved that the Board accept the disciplinary hearing panel recommendation in the matter of Ben B. Boothe and Richard J. Tibbenham. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

**VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

**DIRECTOR'S REPORT.**

A. **Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on August 31, 2015.** (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle to approve Board staff to issue an order to suspend the individual listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by December 31, 2015 and authority to issue certificates.** (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies.** (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to approve Board staff to issue a certificate of registration to the company listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |

Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by December 31, 2015 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "G")**

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item IV, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**V. COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

**A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee.** No report.

**B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:**

**1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "H")**

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item V. B. 1. 2-3. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item V. B. 1. 1. A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "I")**

(A) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2 (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to allow staff to be given authority to issue a trainee appraiser credential to the individual listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2 (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to allow staff to be given authority to reinstate a reciprocal credential to the individual listed in Agenda Item V. B. 2. (C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

**3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "J")**

(A) Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to allow staff to be given authority to issue upgrade certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V. B. 3 (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. **Legislation & Rules Committee.** No action.

D. **Probable Cause Committee.**

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No action.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No action.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "K")

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item V. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #A15-027, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-035, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-037, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-038, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |

Mr. Caesar Yes

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-039, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-040, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-041, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-042, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-043, Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair

ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-044, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further action. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #15-045, Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that the individual receive a non-disciplinary letter of concern, the file closed and no further action be taken.. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Recused |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPOINTMENT OF INDIVIDUALS TO EDUCATION, EXPERIENCE AND TESTING COMMITTEE; LEGISLATION AND RULES COMMITTEE; AND INDIVIDUALS TO STANDARDS AND DISCIPLINARY PROCEDURES COMMITTEE WITH CONCURRENT APPOINTMENT AS APPRAISER HEARING OFFICERS FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2016. No action. (Exhibit "L")

VII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF DRAFT LANGUAGE TO AMEND BOARD RULES AT 600:10-1-5 AND 600:10-1-16 IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE JANUARY 1, 2015 APPRAISER QUALIFICATION CRITERIA CHANGES. (Exhibit "M")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle to approve the draft language to amend board rules listed in Agenda Item VII. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

|                 |              |         |
|-----------------|--------------|---------|
| ROLL CALL VOTE: | Mr. Artman   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Cagle    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Smith    | Yes     |
|                 | Mr. Walton   | Yes     |
|                 | Ms. Pruitt   | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Smithson | Excused |
|                 | Mr. Caesar   | Yes     |

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE RECUSED. THE

MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- VIII. REPORT BY BOARD MEMBERS AS TO THEIR ATTENDANCE AT THE PUBLIC MEETING OF THE APPRAISER QUALIFICATIONS BOARD AND THE FALL CONFERENCE OF THE ASSOCIATION OF APPRAISER REGULATOR OFFICIALS IN WASHINGTON, D.C. No action. (Exhibit "N")
- IX. NEW BUSINESS. No action.
- X. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted herein and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through N.



A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Lee R. Caesar Jr.", written over a horizontal line.

**LEE R. CAESAR JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD  
*STEPHEN WALTON, TEMPORARY VICE-CHAIRPERSON*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Eric M. Schoen", written over a horizontal line.

**ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY**  
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD