



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

July 10, 2013
Date

251
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held its regularly scheduled meeting on July 10, 2013 at 9:30 a.m. The Meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, July 8, 2013 at 9:00 a.m., and was mailed or hand delivered to the offices of the Board members on July 2, 2013 and posted to the REAB website on July 8, 2013. The agenda is attached as Exhibit A.

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Vice-Chairperson Lee R. Caesar, Jr. called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Lee R. Caesar, Jr.;
James R. Artman;
Betty J. Cagle;
P. Lane Wheeler;
Stephen C. Walton;
Shelley Pruitt; and
John P. Smithson

Board members excused were: John D. Doak, Chairperson

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Barron Brown, Counsel for Commissioner John D. Doak; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Rebecca Keesee, Legal Secretary; and Eric Schoen, Board Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Glinda Cordell, Mike Cordell; Brittany Byers, Tyler Laughlin, Jay Josephs, Robin Poteet and Carol Cooper.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit B) Mr. Wheeler moved that the reading of the minutes of the June 5, 2013 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding a Request for Implementation of a Payment Plan as to the Costs Imposed Under Board Order #13-011; In The Matter of James R. Singley; Complaint #12-006.** (Exhibit C)

Mr. Caesar recused himself from consideration of Agenda Item III due to Probable Cause Committee service.

Upon recusal of Mr. Caesar, Mr. Smithson moved that Mr. Wheeler be nominated as interim Vice-Chairperson. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Walton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After a brief oral presentation by Brittany Byers, Counsel for Respondent, Singley, Mr. Walton made a Motion to go into executive session. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

The Chair declared the Board to be back in open session. The Chair ordered a roll call to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: James R. Artman;
Betty J. Cagle;
P. Lane Wheeler
Stephen C. Walton;
Shelley Pruitt; and
John P. Smithson

Ms. Pruitt made a Motion that Mr. Singley be allowed to pay the sum of \$100.00 per month for twelve months with the remaining balance due and fully payable on July 12, 2014. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Cagle. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. **Discussion and Possible Action Regarding the Board's Denial of an Application for Registration of Value Trend Solutions as an Oklahoma Appraisal Management Company and a Request for Opportunity to Address the Board as to Reconsideration of its Decision by Jay Adam Josephs, 40% Owner of Value Trend Solutions**
(Exhibit D)

After allowing Mr. Josephs an opportunity to address the Board, Mr. Wheeler made a Motion to amend the Board's decision with regard to Value Trend Solutions and allow for their registration as a registered Appraisal Management Company in the State of Oklahoma. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Walton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes

Ms. Pruitt	No
Mr. Smithson	No
Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND TWO OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson welcomed James Artman as the new Board Member replacing Patti Fisher whose term expired June 30, 2013.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on April 30, 2013. (Exhibit E)

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to issue an order to suspend the individual listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report A. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by August 31, 2013 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit F)

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificates of registration for Appraisal Management Companies. (Exhibit G)

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to approve Board staff to issue original certificates of registration to the companies listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by August 31, 2013 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit H)

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Walton to issue certificates of registration to the companies listed in Agenda Item V, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VI. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit I)

Mr. Walton made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VI. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of various applications received and authority to issue certificates.(Exhibit J)

2(A) Mr. Smithson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Wheeler to allow staff to be given authority to issue reciprocal licenses to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2(A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2(B) Mr. Smithson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Wheeler to allow staff to approve the application for reinstatement of reciprocal credential and be given authority to issue a credential to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2(B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes

Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2(C) Mr. Smithson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Wheeler to allow staff to be given authority to issue trainee appraiser credentials to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 2(C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit K)

3(A) Mr. Smithson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Wheeler to allow the staff to be given authority to approve the application for upgrade and be given authority to issue an upgrade certificate to the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3(A), contingent upon receipt of proof of acceptable examination results and payment of required fees. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3(B) Mr. Smithson made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Wheeler to allow the staff to be given authority to deny the application for upgrade of the individual listed in Agenda Item VI. B. 3(B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation and Rules Committee. No Action.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee. No action.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No action.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit L)

Mr. Caesar is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VI. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance A13-002, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-002, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-003, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that a non-disciplinary Letter of Concern be issued to the Respondent, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-008, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-010, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Cagle seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-011, a Motion was made by Ms. Pruitt that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Mr. Wheeler seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-012, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Pruitt seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-013, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that a Letter of Warning be issued to the Respondent, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Pruitt seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-014, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Pruitt seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes

Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Yes
Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-015, a Motion was made by Mr. Wheeler that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Ms. Pruitt seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance 13-016, a Motion was made by Ms. Pruitt that the matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. Mr. Wheeler seconded the Motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Recused

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

At this point, Agenda VI. D. 2. was heard out of order, by order of the Chair.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. (Exhibit M) No action taken.

At this point, Agenda Items VII and VIII were heard in reverse order, by order of the Chair.

VIII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Implementation of an Online Licensing Program known as "AMANDA" in Response to the Oklahoma State Government Modernization Act of 2009. (Exhibit N)

Following discussion of the requirements mandated by the Oklahoma State Government Modernization Act of 2009 and the benefits of AMANDA, Ms. Cagle made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that the implementation of the online licensing program (AMANDA) be approved. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Approval of Draft Budget for FY 2014. (Exhibit O)

Mr. Wheeler made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle to approve the budget as

presented and to amend the budget to include a separate line item for hardware and software upgrades in the amount of \$15,000.00. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- IX. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Board Adoption of BOMA and ANSI as Recognized Measurement Standards. No action taken.
- X. Discussion and Possible Action Regarding Attendance at the Fall Conference of the Association of Appraiser Regulatory Officials by Board Members and Board Staff Between October 18 and 21 in Washington, D.C. (Exhibit P) No action taken.
- XI. NEW BUSINESS.
- XII. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted herein and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through P.





LEE R. CAESAR JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD



ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD