



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

February 1, 2008
Date

187
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held its regularly scheduled meeting February 1, 2008 at 9:35 a.m. The Meeting was held in the Boardroom of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 2401 Northwest 23rd Street, Suite 28, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. § 301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted in the main entrance to the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department on January 23, 2008, and was mailed to the offices of the Board members and posted to the REAB website on January 23, 2008. The addendum to the agenda was posted in the main entrance to the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department on January 28, 2008, and was mailed to the offices of the Board members and posted to the REAB website on January 28, 2008. The second addendum to the agenda was posted in the main entrance to the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department on January 28, 2008, and was mailed to the offices of the Board members and posted to the REAB website on January 28, 2008. The agenda and addenda are attached as Exhibit A.

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Vice-Chairperson Lee Caesar Jr. called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Kim Holland, Chairperson;
Lee R. Caesar, Jr., Vice-Chairperson
Patti L. Fisher;
James W. Hoyt;
Lane Wheeler;
Kim N. Allen;
Jana S. Barker; and
Joey Snyder;

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Rod Stirman, Director; Sandra LaVenue, attorney for Commissioner Kim Holland; Joann Stevenson, Board Counsel; Tiffany Davis, Board Secretary, and Christine McEntire, Board Legal Secretary. Others present were: Hal Hartsock, Greg Goodpasture, Annemieke Roell, Rick Carlile, and Steve McCaleb, Board Prosecutor.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** Mr. Hoyt moved that the reading of the minutes of the January 4, 2008 session be waived and approved as published as distributed. The motion was seconded by Mr. Wheeler. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Ms. Fisher moved that the reading of the minutes of the January 28, 2008 special session be waived and approved as published as distributed. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hoyt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.** The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees. A motion was made by Ms. Fisher and seconded by Mr. Hoyt to issue an order to suspend individuals listed in agenda item III, Director's Report A for non-payment of annual fees due by November 30, 2007. (Exhibit B) The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit C) A motion was made by Ms. Fisher and seconded by Mr. Allen to approve board staff to issue renewal certificates of individuals listed in agenda item III, Director's Report B upon receipt of proof of their CE and payment of appropriate fees. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Not Voting
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

By order of the Chair, Agenda Item VI(B) was taken out of order and offered for consideration at this point in the session.

VI(B). **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING BILLS FILED IN CURRENT LEGISLATIVE SESSION AFFECTING REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD.**

1. **SB 1185.**
2. **SB 1602.**
3. **SB 1603.**
4. **SB 2195.**
5. **HB 3173.**

Mr. Hoyt made a motion to appoint a committee consisting of Mr. Wheeler, Mr. Caesar, and Mr. Hoyt to study and then make a recommendation on all bills. The motion was seconded by Ms. Fisher. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Not Voting
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

By order of the Chair, Agenda Item VI was taken out of order and offered for consideration at this point in the session.

VI. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING RECOMMENDATION OF DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL IN COMPLAINT #06-002, IN THE MATTER OF DAN W. MONTAGUE, TO INCLUDE HEARING OF ORAL ARGUMENT.**

Mr. Wheeler, Mr. Allen, Mr. Hoyt, and Ms. Fisher recused themselves from consideration of Agenda Item VI.

The Director announced the appointment of one Board member Pro-Tempore' by the Office of the Governor, Mr. Jimmie R. Burton. (Exhibit D)

The Chair ordered a roll call vote to establish a quorum.

Board members present were:	Jana Barker
	Joey Snyder;
	Jimmie Burton;
	Lee Caesar Jr.; and
	Commissioner Kim Holland

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the chair.

The Board members present were asked by Board counsel to affirm that they did not have outside information about the pleadings in the case or ex-parte communications about Complaint #06-002, in the matter of Dan W. Montague, or any personal animas or bias, or any particular friendship or animosity towards any of the recusing Board members or anyone else involved with the case that would make them be unfair to Mr. Montague. Their answers were as follows:

Mr. Snyder	NO
Mr. Burton	NO
Mr. Caesar	NO
Commissioner Holland	NO
Ms. Barker	NO

Ms. Barker made a motion to deny respondent's motion for recusal of entire Real Estate Appraiser Board. The motion was seconded by Mr. Burton.

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Mr. Burton	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Commissioner Holland	Not Voting

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following a short discussion on prosecution's objection to respondent's motion for continuance and motion to strike respondent's brief and respondent's request for oral argument, Ms. Barker made a motion the Board enter executive session. The motion was seconded by Mr. Burton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Mr. Burton	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Commissioner Holland	Not Voting

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

The Chair declared the Board to be back in open session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Jana Barker
Joey Snyder;
Jimmie Burton;
Lee Caesar Jr.; and
Commissioner Kim Holland

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the chair.

Ms. Barker made a motion to strike the brief because it was received late in violation of the rules, but allow oral argument. The motion was seconded by Mr. Burton. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Mr. Burton	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Commissioner Holland	Not Voting

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After a short discussion including remarks by Mr. Roberts and Mr. McCaleb regarding the disciplinary hearing panel recommendation in Complaint # 06-002, in the matter of Dan W. Montague, Ms. Barker made a motion the Board enter executive session. The motion was seconded by Mr. Snyder. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Mr. Burton	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Commissioner Holland	Not Voting

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

The Chair declared the Board to be back in open session. The Chair ordered a roll call vote to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Jana Barker
Joey Snyder;
Jimmie Burton;
Lee Caesar Jr.; and
Commissioner Kim Holland

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the chair.

A motion was made by Ms. Barker to adopt the findings of fact and conclusions of law as presented and accept the hearing panel recommendation. The motion was seconded by Mr. Snyder. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Mr. Burton	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Commissioner Holland	Not Voting

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt, Mr. Allen, Mr. Wheeler, and Ms. Fisher were reseated. Mr. Burton was excused.

The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: Kim Holland, Chairperson;
Lee R. Caesar, Jr., Vice-Chairperson
Patti L. Fisher;
James W. Hoyt;
Lane Wheeler;
Kim N. Allen;
Jana S. Barker; and
Joey Snyder;

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

By order of the Chair, the Board returned to regular order.

IV. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No Report.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit E) A motion was made by Ms. Barker and seconded by Mr. Snyder to approve the courses as presented in Agenda item IV B (1). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of various applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit F)

A Motion was made by Mr. Hoyt and seconded by Mr. Wheeler to allow staff to be given authority to issue trainee certificates to the individuals listed in agenda item IV B 2 (A) with conditions as specified. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

A Motion was made by Mr. Hoyt and seconded by Ms. Barker to allow staff to be given authority to issue an original certificate by reciprocity to the individual listed in agenda item IV B 2 (B) contingent upon confirmation of applicant's social security number. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

A Motion was made by Mr. Hoyt and seconded by Ms. Barker to allow staff to be given authority to issue a reinstatement certificate to the individual listed in agenda item IV B 2 (C) who has been found fully qualified including continuing education and required fees. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SEVEN VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit G)

Mr. Allen made a motion that the upgrade application of Joseph Holsinger be disapproved as recommended. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hoyt. The chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Not Voting
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt made a motion that the upgrade application of Nancy Dyson be disapproved as recommended. The motion was seconded by Mr. Allen. The chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Not Voting
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt made a motion that the upgrade application of Maurice Ward be disapproved as recommended. The motion was seconded by Mr. Snyder. The chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Not Voting
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND NONE OPPOSED.
THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Legislation and Rules Committee. No Report.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.** No Action.

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee.** No Action.

3. **Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations.** The Probable Cause Committee met on Friday, January 18, 2008. Ms. Barker, Mr. Bardsley, Mr. Brown, and Mr. Carlile were in attendance; as were, Mr. McCaleb, Board Prosecutor; Ms. McEntire, Legal Secretary; and Mr. Stirman, Board Director. Their report is attached as Exhibit H.

Mr. Allen moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Complaint #07-066 be accepted, the matter be adopted as a formal complaint and forwarded to a prosecutor for action. Ms. Fisher seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance # 08-001 (mistakenly numbered on the PCC report as 07-080) be accepted and a letter of postponement be issued with the conditions that the appraiser successfully complete specified education courses from a sponsoring entity of the Appraisal Foundation within six months of the date of the letter, which may be extended up to three months by the Director for good cause shown, or if Respondent fail to comply, the matter be adopted as a formal complaint and forwarded by the staff to a prosecutor without further Board action. Ms. Fisher seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	No
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance #07-083 be accepted, the matter not be adopted as a formal complaint and the matter be closed without further action. Ms. Fisher seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance #07-085 be accepted, the matter not be adopted as a formal complaint, and that the case be closed, but pended against the files of the two individuals should they apply for reinstatement in the future. Ms. Fisher seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Wheeler moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance #07-091 be accepted, the matter not be adopted as a formal complaint and the matter be closed without further action. Mr. Hoyt seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance # 07-098 (mistakenly numbered on the PCC report as 07-094) be accepted and a letter of postponement be issued with the conditions that the appraiser successfully complete specified education courses from a sponsoring entity of the Appraisal Foundation within six months of the date of the letter, which may be extended up to three months by the Director for good cause shown, or if Respondent fail to comply, the matter be adopted as a formal complaint and forwarded by the staff to a prosecutor without further Board action. Ms. Fisher seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	No
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance #07-097 not be accepted. Mr. Wheeler seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Ms. Fisher moved that a letter of warning be sent regarding the Ethics Rules in USPAP to the respondents in Grievance #07-097. Mr. Wheeler seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	No
	Mr. Hoyt	No
	Mr. Allen	No
	Mr. Snyder	No
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS TWO VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, FOUR OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION FAILED.

Mr. Wheeler moved that Grievance #07-097 be closed. Mr. Hoyt seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Ms. Fisher moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance #07-101 be accepted, the matter be adopted as a formal complaint and forwarded to a prosecutor for action. Mr. Wheeler seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Not Voting
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Ms. Fisher moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance #07-102 be accepted, the matter be adopted as a formal complaint and forwarded to a prosecutor for action. Mr. Hoyt seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND ONE RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Mr. Hoyt moved that the Probable Cause Committee recommendation with respect to Grievance #07-105 be accepted, the matter not be adopted as a formal complaint and the matter be closed without further action. Mr. Wheeler seconded the motion. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Recused
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Recused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, NONE OPPOSED, AND TWO RECUSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF CONSENT ORDER IN COMPLAINT #05-082, 06-093, 06-128, AND 06-144, IN THE MATTER OF KEVIN F. BRODERICK.** Passed until March.

VI(A). **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE PROPOSED PERMANENT AMENDMENTS TO CHAPTERS 10 AND 15, TITLE 600, OKLAHOMA ADMINISTRATIVE CODE TO INCLUDE RECEIPT OF COMMENTS, CONDUCT OF PUBLIC HEARING, AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION.**

A motion was made by Mr. Hoyt and seconded by Mr. Allen adopt the proposed permanent amendments to Chapters 10 and 15, Title 600, Oklahoma Administrative Code. Mr. Hoyt amended the motion to modify the proposed amendments to 600:10-1-8 (e) (3) to a non-refundable \$50.00 application fee. The amended motion was seconded by Mr. Allen. The chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Ms. Barker	Yes
	Mr. Wheeler	Yes
	Mr. Hoyt	Yes
	Mr. Allen	Yes
	Mr. Snyder	Yes
	Ms. Fisher	Yes
	Mr. Caesar	No

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE AND ONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. **NEW BUSINESS.** No New Business.

VIII. **ADJOURNMENT.**

Mr. Hoyt made a motion for adjournment. The motion was seconded by Ms. Fisher. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after motion duly made and seconded has been noted herein and made a part of these minutes.

The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board.

Exhibits are A through H.



LEE B. CAESAR JR., VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD


GEORGE R. STIRMAN III, DIRECTOR
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD