



STATE OF OKLAHOMA
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

OFFICIAL MINUTES

June 1, 2016
Date

287
Number

The Real Estate Appraiser Board, established pursuant to the provisions of the Oklahoma Certified Real Estate Appraisers Act, held a regular session meeting on June 1, 2016 at 9:30 a.m. The meeting was held in the Public Meeting Room of the offices of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 5 Corporate Plaza, 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma. In compliance with the Open Meeting Act, 25 O.S. §301 et seq., the agenda for this meeting was posted at the main entrance of the Oklahoma Insurance Department at 3625 NW 56th Street, Suite 100, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma on Monday, May 31, 2016 at 9:00 a.m., and transmitted to the offices of the Board members on May 24, 2016 and posted to the REAB website on May 31, 2016. The agenda is attached as Exhibit "A".

- I. **CALL TO ORDER.** Stephen C. Walton called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The roll of Board members was called to establish a quorum.

Board members present were: John D. Doak;
 Stephen C. Walton;
 James R. Artman;
 Betty J. Cagle;
 H.E. Ted Smith;
 Lee R. Caesar Jr.;
 Shelley Pruitt

Board members excused were: John Smithson.

Based on the result of the roll call, a quorum was declared present by the Chair.

Others in attendance were: Christine McEntire, Director; Bryan Neal, Assistant Attorney General; Barron Brown, OI Counsel; Eric Schoen, Board Secretary and Sherry Ainsworth, Legal Secretary. Others present were: Steve McCaleb, Joe Garnand, Brett Robinson, Ron Flowers, Rachel Mor and Stefan Barnhouse.

- II. **READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES.** (Exhibit "B")

Mr. Caesar moved that the reading of the minutes of the May 4, 2016 session be waived and approved as published and distributed. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Pruitt. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- III. **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A REQUEST FOR A 60 DAY EXTENSION TO COMPLETE THE CORRECTIVE EDUCATION REQUIREMENTS OF BOARD ORDER #15-017 IN THE MATTER OF STEFAN M. BARNHOUSE; COMPLAINT #15-002, #15-003 AND #15-005 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS.** (Exhibit "D")

At the request of Stephen McCaleb, the Board moved agenda item VI. forward to accommodate Rachel Mor's schedule.

TAKEN OUT OF ORDER

VI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT AGREEMENT IN THE MATTER OF ELIZABETH J. ANGELO; COMPLAINT #15-029 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "C")

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VI. in his capacity as former Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Ms. Cagle moved to nominate Lee R. Caesar Jr. as temporary vice-chairperson. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After a brief presentation by Stephen McCaleb and Rachel More, Ms. Cagle moved to accept the Consent Agreement as listed in Agenda Item VI. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

III. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A REQUEST FOR A 60 DAY EXTENSION TO COMPLETE THE CORRECTIVE EDUCATION REQUIREMENTS OF BOARD ORDER #15-017 IN THE MATTER OF STEFAN M. BARNHOUSE; COMPLAINT #15-002, #15-003 AND #15-005 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "D")

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item III. in his capacity as former Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following a brief discussion by Stefan Barnhouse and Steven McCaleb, Ms. Cagle moved to accept the request for a 60 Day Extension as listed in Agenda Item III. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Caesar. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED, AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

IV. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A DISCIPLINARY HEARING PANEL RECOMMENDATION IN THE MATTER OF TERRY L. BUFORD; COMPLAINT #15-020 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "E")

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item IV. in his capacity as former Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following a brief discussion by Steven McCaleb regarding Agenda Item IV., Ms. Cagle moved that the Board go into executive session. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Caesar. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

After coming out of executive session, the Chair ordered a roll call with the following results:

ROLL CALL:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes
	Com. Doak	Yes

Ms. Pruitt moved that the Board accept the disciplinary hearing panel recommendation listed in agenda item IV. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Smith. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

V. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CONSENT AGREEMENT IN THE MATTER OF NANCY L. CATES; COMPLAINT #15-024 TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "F")

Mr. Walton is recused from consideration of Agenda Item V. in his capacity as former Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following a brief discussion by Mr. Steven McCaleb, Ms. Cagle moved that the Board accept the Consent Agreement listed in agenda item V. The Motion was seconded by Mr. Artman. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Recused
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

TAKEN OUT OF ORDER

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

C. Legislation & Rules Committee. No action.

Brett Robinson gave a brief presentation regarding the outcome of the 2016 Legislative Session.

TAKEN OUT OF ORDER

IX. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A BID FOR STATE LEGISLATIVE CONSULTANT SERVICES WITH CAPITAL CITY ASSOCIATES FOR FY 2017 AND FOUR OPTIONS TO RENEW, TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "G")

Mr. Caesar moved that the Board accept the Bid for State Legislative Consultant Services listed in agenda item IX. The Motion was seconded by Ms. Cagle. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VII. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Chairperson offered no report.

VICE-CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. The Vice-Chairperson offered no report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

A. Discussion and possible action regarding suspension of individuals for non-payment of annual fees due on March 31, 2016. No Report.

B. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of renewal applications due by July 31, 2016 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "H")

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve Board staff to issue renewal certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report B. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

C. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of original certificate of registration for appraisal management companies. (Exhibit "I")

Mr. Artman made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve Board staff to issue a certificate of registration to the company listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report C. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
-----------------	------------	-----

Ms. Cagle	Yes
Mr. Smith	Yes
Mr. Walton	Yes
Ms. Pruitt	Yes
Mr. Smithson	Excused
Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of AMC renewal applications due by July 31, 2016 and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "J")

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Artman to issue renewal certificates to the companies listed in Agenda Item VII, Director's Report D. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS:

A. Standards and Disciplinary Procedures Committee. No report.

B. Education, Experience and Testing Committee:

1. Discussion and possible action regarding approval of course submittals. (Exhibit "K")

Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to approve the recommendation as presented in Agenda Item VIII. B. 1. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of reciprocal applications received and authority to issue certificates. (Exhibit "L")

(A) Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to allow staff to be given authority to issue original certificates to the individuals listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2 (A). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(B) Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue a certified general appraiser credential to the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2. (B). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

(C) Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith to allow staff to be given authority to issue a trainee appraiser credential to the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 2 (C). The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding approval or disapproval of experience documentation of applicants. (Exhibit "M")

Ms. Pruitt made a Motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar to adopt the recommendation of denial for the individual listed in Agenda Item VIII. B. 3. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

D. Probable Cause Committee.

1. Discussion and possible action regarding appointment of volunteers and/or committee members to assist Probable Cause Committee.

Mr. Smith made a Motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle to replace Robert M. Liebel with Stephen E. Meyer. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Yes
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS SIX VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

2. Discussion and possible action regarding standing operating procedures for the Probable Cause Committee. No action.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding Probable Cause Committee disciplinary recommendations. (Exhibit "N")

Mr. Artman is recused from consideration of Agenda Item VIII. D. 3. in his capacity as Chair of the Probable Cause Committee.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-007, Mr. Caesar made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that this matter be dismissed, the file closed, and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-008, Ms. Pruitt made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that this matter be dismissed, the file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-009, Ms. Pruitt made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-010 & #16-011, Ms. Pruitt made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Smith that these matters be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes

Mr. Smithson	Excused
Mr. Caesar	No

THE RESULT WAS FOUR VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND ONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-012, Mr. Caesar made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Cagle that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-013, Mr. Caesar made a motion and it was seconded by Ms. Pruitt that a non-disciplinary letter of concern be issued, the file closed and no further action be taken. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

Following discussion of Grievance #16-014, Mr. Smith made a motion and it was seconded by Mr. Caesar that this matter be forwarded to prosecution for further handling. The Chair ordered a roll call vote with the following results:

ROLL CALL VOTE:	Mr. Artman	Recused
	Ms. Cagle	Yes
	Mr. Smith	Yes
	Mr. Walton	Yes
	Ms. Pruitt	Yes
	Mr. Smithson	Excused
	Mr. Caesar	Yes

THE RESULT WAS FIVE VOTES IN THE AFFIRMATIVE, ONE EXCUSED, ONE RECUSED AND NONE OPPOSED. THE MOTION WAS AGREED TO.

- X. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING NOTIFICATION BY TULSA TECHNOLOGY CENTER OF THE TERMINATION OF THEIR APPRAISER EDUCATION PROGRAM AND THE REQUIREMENT OF APPRAISERS TO TAKE 21 HOURS OF "LIVE" CONTINUING EDUCATION TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. (Exhibit "O") No action.
- XI. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE APPRAISAL SUBCOMM'TTEE'S NOTICE OF PROPOSED RULEMAKING TO IMPLEMENT COLLECTION AND TRANSMISSION OF ANNUAL AMC REGISTRY FEES TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. No action.
- XII. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING ADMINISTRATIVE POLICIES AND PROCEDURES RELATED TO THE ENFORCEMENT OF PROBATION ON A RESPONDENT IN A COMPLAINT FILING TO INCLUDE ANY ASSOCIATED MATTERS OR MOTIONS. No action.

XIII. NEW BUSINESS.

XIV. ADJOURNMENT. The Board adjourned by general consent.

OFFICIAL MINUTES.

The action taken by the Oklahoma Real Estate Appraiser Board on the items for consideration after Motion duly made and seconded has been noted, herein, and made a part of these minutes. The Board caused the entire proceeding of the meeting, excepting any executive sessions, to be recorded on a digital audio recording device to be retained as a record in the office of the Board. Exhibits are A through N.



A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "S. C. Walton", written over a horizontal line.

STEPHEN C. WALTON, VICE-CHAIRPERSON
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Eric M. Schoen", written over a horizontal line.

ERIC M. SCHOEN, BOARD SECRETARY
OKLAHOMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD